

Bristol City Council

Minutes of the Full Council

13 December 2022 at 2.00 pm



Members Present:-

Councillors: Mayor Marvin Rees, Lord Mayor Paula O'Rourke, Amal Ali, Donald Alexander, Lesley Alexander, Kerry Bailes, Jenny Bartle, Nicola Beech, Mark Bradshaw, Fabian Breckels, Andrew Brown, Craig Cheney, Jos Clark, Sarah Classick, Amirah Cole, Chris Davies, Carla Denyer, Kye Dudd, Richard Eddy, Jude English, Martin Fodor, Lorraine Francis, John Geater, Paul Goggin, Geoff Gollop, Zoe Goodman, John Goulandris, Fi Hance, Alex Hartley, Tom Hathway, Helen Holland, Gary Hopkins, Katja Hornchen, Jonathan Hucker, Philippa Hulme, Farah Hussain, Chris Jackson, Hibaq Jama, Ellie King, Heather Mack, Mohamed Makawi, Brenda Massey, Henry Michallat, Yassin Mohamud, Graham Morris, Steve Pearce, Ed Plowden, Guy Poultney, Kevin Quartley, Tom Renhard, Tim Ripington, James Scott, Sharon Scott, Steve Smith, Ani Stafford-Townsend, Lisa Stone, Christine Townsend, Andrew Varney, Mark Weston, David Wilcox, Chris Windows and Tim Wye

1 Welcome and Introductions

The Lord Mayor welcomed all attendees to the meeting and issued the safety information.

2 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were heard from Councillors Bennett, Craig, Dyer, Edwards, Fitzjohn, Kent, Grant, Fitzgibbon and Parsons.

3 Declarations of Interest

None received.

4 Minutes of Previous Meetings

It was agreed that the minutes of 18 October 2022 Item 12 be amended to read "There was a debate".

On the motion of the Lord Mayor, seconded by Councillor Hance, it was



RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the meeting of the Full Council held on the 18 October 2022 and 8 November 2022 be confirmed as correct record and signed by the Lord Mayor.

5 Lord Mayor's Business

Full Council noted the sad news that former Councillors Alf Havvock and Tony Carey had recently passed away. Full Council also noted the passing of George 'Johnny' Johnson, the last surviving Dambuster. Members paid tribute to their memory and a minutes' silence was observed.

6 Public Petitions, Statements and Questions**Public Statements**

Full Council received and noted the following statements, which were also referred to the Mayor for his consideration and information.

Ref No	Name	Title
AS01	Ald Anthony Negus	Take back control of our bus services
PS01	Haydn Gill	Leadership for cycling
PS02	Rob Bryher	Suspend the Deregulated Bus Market
PS03	Louise Polledri	The Lack of Public Access Automatic External Defibrillators (AED's) in and around Bristol
PS04	Simon Brookes	Promoting More Practical Awareness of CPR
PS05	Craig Lamkin	Resident statement on the proposed changes to the A4018
PS06	Liv Fortune	Bristol Central Library
PS07	Sian Ellis-Thomas	Better Facilities in Redcatch Park
PS08	Suzanne Audrey	The Financialisation of Housing
PS09	Janet Croucher	Protect our green spaces
PS10	Angie Yeo	Save our green spaces.
PS11	Janet Poole	The Iron Bridge Kingsweston
PS12	Deborah Hurst	NO MORE BUILDING ON BRISTOLS GREEN SPACES. INFACT INCREASE THEM
PS13	David Redgewell	City region bus services
PS14	Louise Somerville	Trans Rights are Human Rights



PS15	Clive Stevens	Committee Model Working Group
PS16	Dr Tim Godfrey / Joe Hughes	Improving AED provision and knowledge
PS17	Stephen McNamara	Trans Right Motion
PS18	Hannah Mishan	Bristol Cycling Delivery Plan
PS19	Christina Biggs / Katrina Billings	Bristol Clean Air Alliance (BCAA)

Within the time available, statements AS01, PS01, PS02, PS03, PS04, PS06, PS07, PS14 and PS16 were presented by individuals present at the meeting.

Public Questions

Full Council noted that the following questions had been submitted:

Ref No	Name	Title
PQ01	Michael Owen	Councillors and Council Tax
PQ02	John Broomhead	Property Question St Peters Hospice
PQ03	Liv Fortune	Central Library
PQ04	Alison Allan	Citizen Assembly Recommendations
PQ05	Nigel Shipley	City Leap
PQ06	Rick Alden	City Leap
PQ07	Harriet Williams	Climate Emergency Strategy
PQ08	Clive Weston	Cycling and Pedestrian Plan
PQ09	Haydn Gill	Lorry direct vision standard and Metro (un)feasibility
PQ10	Rob Bryher	Bus Services
PQ11	Sarah Cemlyn	Cycling and Pedestrian Plan
PQ12	Claire Gronow	Private Car Journeys
PQ13	Andrea MacKay	Cycling on Gloucester Road
PQ14	Taru Silvonon	Heat Network
PQ15	Suzanne Audrey	House Building
PQ16	Anne de Verteuil	Footpath maintenance
PQ17	Isabeau Kenmuir	City Leap Energy Supply
PQ18	Isabeau Kenmuir	Public Transport
PQ19	Greg Cooper	Carbon Emissions
PQ20	Tom Bosanquet	Leaves
PQ21	Tom Bosanquet	Attitudes Towards Cyclists
PQ22	Catherine Whiteman	Cycling Plan
PQ23	Stephen Lowis	Cycling Plan
PQ24	David Redgewell	WECA Transfer



PQ25	Gaby Solly	Tree Protection
PQ26	Ald Antony Negus	Central Library
PQ27	Ald Antony Negus	Street Lighting in Cotham
PQ28	Dave Mitchell	Climate Emergency

Within the time available, the Mayor responded verbally to questions PQ02, PQ03, PQ05, PQ09, PQ10 also responding to supplementary questions.

7 Petitions Notified by Councillors

The Full Council received and noted the following petitions:

Petition CP01 – Save Central Library – petition presented by Councillor Alex Hartley

8 Committee Model of Governance Working Group Update

Full Council considered a report on the Committee Model of Governance.

Councillor Helen Holland moved the report and the recommendations therein.

There was a debate, and it was:

RESOLVED: That Full Council note the report.

9 Audit Committee Half-Year Report to Full Council

Full Council considered the Audit Committee Half-Year Report.

Councillor Andrew Brown moved the report and the recommendations therein.

There was a debate, and it was:

RESOLVED: That Full Council note the report.

10 Treasury Management Annual Report 2021/22

Full Council considered the Treasury Management Annual Report 2021/22.

Councillor Craig Cheney moved the report and the recommendations therein.



There was a debate on both this item and item 11, and it was:

RESOLVED: That Full Council note the report.

11 Treasury Management Mid-Year Report 2022/23

Full Council considered the Treasury Management Mid-Year Report 2022/23.

Councillor Craig Cheney moved the report and the recommendations therein.

There was a debate on both this item and item 10, and it was:

RESOLVED: That Full Council note the report.

12 HR Committee Annual Report 2021/22

Full Council considered the HR Committee Annual Report for 2021/22

Councillor Lorraine Francis moved the report and the recommendations therein.

There was a debate, and it was:

RESOLVED: That Full Council note the report.

13 Motions

Following a short adjournment, it was then moved by the Lord Mayor that standing order CPR2.1(xi) be suspended to allow the meeting to go past the 2 hour 30 minute time limit. Following a vote, it was agreed to proceed for an additional 30 minutes.

Motion 1 – Golden Motion: Taking Back Public Control of Our Buses

Councillor Andrew Brown moved the following motion:

Full Council notes that:

1. A comprehensive bus service, providing a reliable and economical means of travel to all parts of the city for work, child support, health care, leisure, and other purposes is of vital importance to the city's residents.



2. There are multiple economic and social benefits of maintaining an effective and accessible bus service including
 - a. providing a reliable means of travel for commuters and consumers contributing to the local economy.
 - b. allowing those who would otherwise be isolated more freedom to access safe and social ways to participate in community and city life, improving their wellbeing and aiding independent living. This includes, but is not restricted to, those with physical or other disabilities, the elderly, and those on low incomes.
 - c. reducing traffic, congestion, and air pollution through the removal of private vehicles from the roads.
3. The Bus Services Act 2017 allows for alternative models to the provision of bus services where these were previously required to be operated solely by private companies whose working relationship with local authorities was strictly limited. The revised options are Enhanced Partnership, Advanced Quality Partnerships, and Bus Franchising.
4. Bus Franchising offers the opportunity for public direction of innovation of fares, routes, and bus quality.
5. Bus Franchising is being implemented or explored by a number of city and regional authorities across the country including the Greater Manchester Combined Authority.

Full Council believes that:

1. There are significant speed and cost advantages in implementing a more comprehensive mass transit solution based on buses as opposed to alternatives that are dependent on costly and disruptive infrastructure.
2. Implementing bus franchising would provide the opportunity to comprehensively re-think and re-design how the bus service can best serve our citizens, the city, and the region.
3. Services provided under a franchising model would be better designed to meet the needs of the city rather than those of the bus operator(s).
4. Bus Franchising could provide the improvements and innovation required to achieve modal shift, increasing bus usage and reducing private car journeys.
5. Bus Franchising would strengthen the West of England Combined Authority's position in discharging its responsibilities for planning and transport across the region.
6. The West of England Combined Authority's previous dismissal of franchising in favour of developing an Enhanced Partnership was not the result of a comprehensive review of its potential benefits.
7. The Enhanced Partnership model is compromised by the power of veto that the region's major bus provider will have over decision-making.

Full Council resolves to:

1. Instruct the Chief Executive to write to the WECA Mayor requesting that he commissions a comprehensive feasibility study of all aspects of adopting and financing a system of franchising bus services in the region. The commission should also consider how the existing knowledge and experience of each member Authority could also be maximised in the consultation and design of such an approach.



2. Request that the Mayor seeks consensus from the leaders of the other WECA authorities, and the WECA Mayor, in order to facilitate the delivery of a feasibility study as soon as possible.

The motion was seconded by Councillor Andrew Varney.

Councillor Tim Rippington then moved the following amendment:

‘That the motion be amended to read as follows:

Full Council notes that:

1. A comprehensive bus service, providing a reliable and economical means of travel to all parts of the city for work, child support, health care, leisure, and other purposes is a vital part of any city’s integrated transport network and of great importance to the city’s residents.
2. There are multiple economic and social benefits of maintaining an effective and accessible bus service including
 - a. providing a reliable means of travel for commuters and consumers contributing to the local economy.
 - b. allowing those who would otherwise be isolated more freedom to access safe and social ways to participate in community and city life, improving their wellbeing and aiding independent living. This includes, but is not restricted to, those with physical or other disabilities, the elderly, and those on low incomes.
 - c. reducing traffic, congestion, and air pollution through the removal of private vehicles from the roads.
3. The Bus Services Act 2017 prohibits ‘relevant authorities’, such as councils and combined authorities, from establishing municipal (publicly owned) bus companies. However, it allows for some alternative models to the provision of bus services where these were previously required to be operated solely by private companies whose working relationship with local authorities was strictly limited. The revised options are Enhanced Partnership, Advanced Quality Partnerships, and Bus Franchising.
4. Bus Franchising offers the opportunity for public direction of innovation of fares, routes, and bus quality.
5. Bus Franchising is being implemented or explored by a number of city and regional authorities across the country including the Greater Manchester Combined Authority.
6. Franchising the region’s bus network and building the necessary infrastructure to facilitate a reliable, efficient bus service will be costly and time consuming – Greater Manchester’s franchising



scheme will take eight years to materialise. Therefore, further measures are needed to address the bus crisis in the immediate term. Bristol City Council should support WECA in this endeavour wherever possible.

Full Council believes that:

7. As a key public service, bus services should ideally be publicly owned and publicly run. The Government should overturn the ban on councils and combined authorities establishing municipal bus companies.
8. Pending any new government overturning the current legislation, Bus Franchising could provide some of the improvements and innovation required to achieve modal shift, increasing bus usage and reducing private car journeys.
9. Implementing bus franchising would provide the opportunity to comprehensively re-think and re-design how the bus service can best serve our citizens, the city, and the region.
10. Services provided under a franchising model would be better designed to meet the needs of the city rather than those of the bus operator(s).
11. Bus Franchising would strengthen the West of England Combined Authority's position in discharging its responsibilities for planning and transport across the region.
12. The West of England Combined Authority's previous dismissal of franchising in favour of developing an Enhanced Partnership was not the result of a comprehensive review of its potential benefits. The Enhanced Partnership model is compromised by the power of veto that the region's major bus provider will have over decision-making.
13. While a franchised bus service presents a considerable number of upsides, a publicly owned, municipal bus company is preferable, as it offers the same benefits but allows profits to be directly reinvested into the service. This is in contrast to a franchised system, where profits are paid to private shareholders.

Full Council resolves to:

1. Call on Party Group Leaders to write to the Government to ask it overturns the 2017 ban on councils and combined authorities establishing municipal bus companies.
2. Instruct the Chief Executive to write to the WECA Mayor requesting that he commissions a comprehensive feasibility study of all aspects of adopting and financing a system of franchising bus services in the region. The commission should also consider how the existing knowledge and experience of each member Authority could also be maximised in the consultation and design of such an approach.



3. Should the government overturn the ban on the establishment of municipal bus companies, Bristol City Council resolves to work with WECA to commission a feasibility study for a publicly owned bus network. If it is found to be feasible, WECA should prioritise establishing a publicly owned bus network over a franchised network. This view should be reflected in the Chief Executive's letter to the WECA Mayor.

4. Request that the Mayor seeks consensus from the leaders of the other WECA authorities, and the WECA Mayor, in order to facilitate the delivery of a feasibility study as soon as possible.

The amendment was seconded by Councillor Fabian Breckels.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, the amendment was CARRIED (41 For, 15 Against, 1 Abstention).

The Lord Mayor then invited a debate on the Motion as Amended.

Following final remarks, upon being put to the vote, the Motion as Amended was CARRIED (40 For, 14 Against, 2 Abstention) and it was

RESOLVED:

Full Council notes that:

1. **A comprehensive bus service, providing a reliable and economical means of travel to all parts of the city for work, child support, health care, leisure, and other purposes is a vital part of any city's integrated transport network and of great importance to the city's residents.**
2. **There are multiple economic and social benefits of maintaining an effective and accessible bus service including**
 - a. **providing a reliable means of travel for commuters and consumers contributing to the local economy.**
 - b. **allowing those who would otherwise be isolated more freedom to access safe and social ways to participate in community and city life, improving their wellbeing and aiding independent living. This includes, but is not restricted to, those with physical or other disabilities, the elderly, and those on low incomes.**
 - c. **reducing traffic, congestion, and air pollution through the removal of private vehicles from the roads.**
3. **The Bus Services Act 2017 prohibits 'relevant authorities', such as councils and combined authorities, from establishing municipal (publicly owned) bus companies. However, it allows for some**



alternative models to the provision of bus services where these were previously required to be operated solely by private companies whose working relationship with local authorities was strictly limited. The revised options are Enhanced Partnership, Advanced Quality Partnerships, and Bus Franchising.

4. Bus Franchising offers the opportunity for public direction of innovation of fares, routes, and bus quality.
5. Bus Franchising is being implemented or explored by a number of city and regional authorities across the country including the Greater Manchester Combined Authority.
6. Franchising the region's bus network and building the necessary infrastructure to facilitate a reliable, efficient bus service will be costly and time consuming – Greater Manchester's franchising scheme will take eight years to materialise. Therefore, further measures are needed to address the bus crisis in the immediate term. Bristol City Council should support WECA in this endeavour wherever possible.

Full Council believes that:

7. As a key public service, bus services should ideally be publicly owned and publicly run. The Government should overturn the ban on councils and combined authorities establishing municipal bus companies.
8. Pending any new government overturning the current legislation, Bus Franchising could provide some of the improvements and innovation required to achieve modal shift, increasing bus usage and reducing private car journeys.
9. Implementing bus franchising would provide the opportunity to comprehensively re-think and re-design how the bus service can best serve our citizens, the city, and the region.
10. Services provided under a franchising model would be better designed to meet the needs of the city rather than those of the bus operator(s).
11. Bus Franchising would strengthen the West of England Combined Authority's position in discharging its responsibilities for planning and transport across the region.
12. The West of England Combined Authority's previous dismissal of franchising in favour of developing an Enhanced Partnership was not the result of a comprehensive review of its potential benefits. The Enhanced Partnership model is compromised by the power of veto that the region's major bus provider will have over decision-making.
13. While a franchised bus service presents a considerable number of upsides, a publicly owned, municipal bus company is preferable, as it offers the same benefits but allows profits to be directly



reinvested into the service. This is in contrast to a franchised system, where profits are paid to private shareholders.

Full Council resolves to:

1. **Call on Party Group Leaders to write to the Government to ask it overturns the 2017 ban on councils and combined authorities establishing municipal bus companies.**
2. **Instruct the Chief Executive to write to the WECA Mayor requesting that he commissions a comprehensive feasibility study of all aspects of adopting and financing a system of franchising bus services in the region. The commission should also consider how the existing knowledge and experience of each member Authority could also be maximised in the consultation and design of such an approach.**
3. **Should the government overturn the ban on the establishment of municipal bus companies, Bristol City Council resolves to work with WECA to commission a feasibility study for a publicly owned bus network. If it is found to be feasible, WECA should prioritise establishing a publicly owned bus network over a franchised network. This view should be reflected in the Chief Executive's letter to the WECA Mayor.**
4. **Request that the Mayor seeks consensus from the leaders of the other WECA authorities, and the WECA Mayor, in order to facilitate the delivery of a feasibility study as soon as possible.**

Motion 2 – Silver Motion: Making Bristol a CPR Friendly City

Councillor Steve Smith moved the following motion:

“This Council was saddened to learn of the sudden death – by cardiac arrest - of Sam Polledri in Millennium Square last February. It was even more tragic to discover that this loss might have been averted if there had been public access to a defibrillator and general knowledge on how to use such a machine.

Consequently, Council welcomes the training now being given to Members on CPR and defibrillation by the Great Western Air Ambulance Charity to highlight this issue. However, a great deal more can and must be done.

In order to make Bristol a leading local authority in this field, and mirroring the work already undertaken in Swansea, Council calls on the Mayor to support and help develop the following proposals:-

- (i) Support and collaborate in a partnership as exists in Swansea with a charitable partner who can fundraise and organise the installation and maintenance of public access defibrillators and raise public awareness around their use



- (ii) Request that the Licensing Committee explore the option of making basic CPR/Defib skills a condition for granting drivers a license to operate a taxi in Bristol
- (iii) Ask the Local Plan Working Group to examine whether new building developments above a pre-determined size should be required to also include an accessible defibrillator
- (iv) Work with One City partners to make available basic CPR and / or defibrillator training in our local schools, colleges, and universities
- (v) Agree to install a defibrillator – available 24/7 – outside City Hall to not only provide an additional life-saving resource but also demonstrate a genuine commitment to this worthwhile cause.”

Councillor Graham Morris seconded the motion.

Following debate, upon being put to the vote, the motion was CARRIED (58 for, 0 Against, 0 Abstentions) and it was

RESOLVED:

“This Council was saddened to learn of the sudden death – by cardiac arrest - of Sam Polledri in Millennium Square last February. It was even more tragic to discover that this loss might have been averted if there had been public access to a defibrillator and general knowledge on how to use such a machine.

Consequently, Council welcomes the training now being given to Members on CPR and defibrillation by the Great Western Air Ambulance Charity to highlight this issue. However, a great deal more can and must be done.

In order to make Bristol a leading local authority in this field, and mirroring the work already undertaken in Swansea, Council calls on the Mayor to support and help develop the following proposals:-

- (i) Support and collaborate in a partnership as exists in Swansea with a charitable partner who can fundraise and organise the installation and maintenance of public access defibrillators and raise public awareness around their use**
- (ii) Request that the Licensing Committee explore the option of making basic CPR/Defib skills a condition for granting drivers a license to operate a taxi in Bristol**
- (iii) Ask the Local Plan Working Group to examine whether new building developments above a pre-determined size should be required to also include an accessible defibrillator**
- (iv) Work with One City partners to make available basic CPR and / or defibrillator training in our local schools, colleges, and universities**
- (v) Agree to install a defibrillator – available 24/7 – outside City Hall to not only provide an additional life-saving resource but also demonstrate a genuine commitment to this worthwhile cause.”**



Meeting ended at 5.20 pm

CHAIR _____

